

EXTENDED BAT ALGORITHM
FOR PID CONTROLLER TUNING OF
WHEELED MOBILE ROBOT AND
SWARM ROBOTICS
TARGET SEARCHING STRATEGY

NUR AISYAH SYAFINAZ BT. SUARIN

MASTER OF SCIENCE

UNIVERSITI MALAYSIA PAHANG



SUPERVISOR'S DECLARATION

We hereby declare that We have checked this thesis, and, in our opinion, this thesis is adequate in terms of scope and quality for the award of the degree of Master of Science.

(Supervisor's Signature)

Full Name : DR. DWI PEBRIANTI
Position : SENIOR LECTURER
Date : 20th FEBRUARY 2020

(Co-supervisor's Signature)

Full Name : MR. ZULKIFLI B. MUSA
Position : LECTURER
Date :20th FEBRUARY 2020



STUDENT'S DECLARATION

I hereby declare that the work in this thesis is based on my original work except for quotations and citations which have been duly acknowledged. I also declare that it has not been previously or concurrently submitted for any other degree at Universiti Malaysia Pahang or any other institutions.

(Student's Signature)

Full Name : NUR AISYAH SYAFINAZ BT. SUARIN

ID Number : MEG18002

Date : 20th FEBRUARY 2020

EXTENDED BAT ALGORITHM
FOR PID CONTROLLER TUNING OF WHEELED MOBILE
ROBOT AND SWARM ROBOTICS
TARGET SEARCHING STRATEGY

NUR AISYAH SYAFINAZ BT. SUARIN

Thesis submitted in fulfillment of the requirements
for the award of the degree of
Master of Science

Faculty of Electrical & Electronic Engineering Technology
UNIVERSITI MALAYSIA PAHANG

FEBRUARY 2020

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Alhamdulillah. All praises belong to Allah, the lord of the whole universe who blesses my life with his greatest blessing and love.

My deepest and highest appreciation to my family: my late father, Suarin bin Ibrahim and my mother, Noriah bt. Abu Samah, my siblings, my nephew, Muhammad Rayyan and my whole family. Their endless support, prayers and unconditional love have made me for who I am today.

Foremost, I would like to express my sincere gratitude to my supervisor, Dr. Dwi Pebrianti for the continuous support during the journey of my master research study, for the patience, motivation, enthusiasm, and immense knowledge. Her guidance helped me for all the time of research and writing of this thesis. Not to forget as well the spiritual and motivational support from my co-supervisor, Mr. Zulkifli b. Musa.

Next, I would like to thank my thesis examiners: Associate Prof. Dr. Hamzah Ahmad, Associate Prof. Dr. Razali Daud and Dr. Fadhil Abas for the time they spent to review my thesis, encouragement words and insightful comments. My sincere thanks also go to my sponsor of this master study, Universiti Malaysia Pahang under Master Research Scheme which supports me financially.

I would like to thank my fellow lab mates in Universiti Malaysia Pahang: Nurnajmin Qasrina Ann and Nurul Fadzlina bt. Jamin for all the discussions, for the sleepless nights we were working together of our own research study, and for all the fun we have had in the last two years. Also, I thank my friends in Universiti Tun Hussein Onn: Nor Fareza bt. Kosmani and Ong Kok Meng for all the meaningful discussions and spiritual support along this journey. In particular, I am grateful to Dr. Chia Kim Seng for enlightening me the first glance of research.

ABSTRAK

Robotik kawanan adalah sistem multi-robot yang mengandungi lebih daripada dua robot bekerja bersama-sama untuk mencapai satu tugas yang tertentu. Robotik kawanan mempunyai potensi besar yang boleh digunakan dalam pelbagai sektor seperti dalam bidang pertanian dan tentera kerana bilangan ketersediaan tenaga kerja dalam sistem dan keupayaan robot untuk melaksanakan dan menyelesaikan tugas lebih cepat daripada kerja kasar. Sistem robotic kawanan terdiri daripada sekurang-kurangnya dua robot dan boleh sehingga beratus-ratus dan beribu-ribu bilangan robot dalam kawanan. Oleh itu, terdapat keperluan segera untuk memantau dan menguruskan pergerakan semua robot untuk mengelakkan apa-apa pelanggaran dan kemalangan antara robot dan pada masa yang sama mengoptimumkan prestasi sistem robotik kawanan. Dalam usaha untuk membina sebuah sistem robotik kawanan yang dapat melaksanakan tugas sasaran mencari, keperluan sistem adalah untuk mempunyai strategi yang mantap. Walau bagaimanapun, penyelesaian semasa strategi pencarian sasaran untuk robotik kawanan adalah tidak memuaskan kerana penyelesaian tidak dapat bergerak dengan cekap dan tidak tiba di kedudukan sasaran dengan tepat. Terdapat banyak faktor yang mungkin menyumbang kepada pengawal bahawa keadaan contohnya, algoritma dan komunikasi. Setiap robot dalam keperluan swarm yang dilengkapi dengan pengawal yang baik, contohnya keteguhan pengawal PID. Walaupun PID adalah pengawal tradisional dengan seni bina mudah, tetapi, penalaan PID pengawal untuk keuntungan yang terbaik dalam usaha untuk membangunkan sistem prestasi yang baik adalah sukar. Oleh itu, untuk mengenal pasti dan menyediakan penyelesaian, kajian penyelidikan ini memutuskan untuk memulakan pendekatan dengan mengoptimumkan pengawal PID di robot beroda bergerak (WMR). Ini kerana, WMR mesti dapat bergerak dengan berkesan dari satu titik ke titik yang lain untuk melaksanakan tugas pencarian sasaran dan menunjukkan prestasi yang baik dalam sistem robotik kawanan. Objektif kajian ini bertujuan untuk penalaan dan mengoptimumkan daripada berkadar-Integral-derivatif (PID) pengawal untuk beroda robot mudah alih (WMR), membangunkan sasaran mencari strategi untuk sistem robotik kawanan dan membandingkan prestasi kaedah dicadangkan dengan kaedah, strategi sasaran pencarian berdasarkan Particle Swarm Optimization (PSO) dan Bat Algoritma (BA). EBA adalah kaedah swarm pengoptimuman hibrid BA dengan SDA. Kelemahan BA untuk meneroka penyelesaian sewajarnya telah diatasi dengan teknik SDA. Kaedah kajian ini dimulakan dengan pengawal berasaskan penalaan PID untuk WMR. Seterusnya, EBA penyesuaian digunakan untuk membangunkan sasaran pencarian robotik swarm untuk dua kes iaitu kedudukan awal yang berbeza dan berbeza jarak robot dalam kawanan dan berbeza penduduk robot dalam kawanan. Akhir sekali, prestasi algoritma dicadangkan berbanding dengan PSO dan BA. Keputusan yang diperolehi daripada kajian penyelidikan ini menunjukkan bahawa pengawal PD ditala oleh EBA mengatasi prestasi PID dan pengawal PI oleh daripada 11.00s dan 12.11s masa kenaikan untuk kedudukan X dan Y masing-masing, 20.08s dan 22.08s menetap masa dan tiada masa terlajak. Dengan menggunakan robot maju dengan pengawal PD, EBA membuktikan potensi untuk membangunkan sasaran terbaik strategi pencarian kepada sistem robotik swarm dengan nombor 5 lelaran dalam tempoh 49 saat yang merupakan nombor yang paling rendah lelaran dalam masa yang singkat dan 99% daripada ketepatan untuk tiba di lokasi yang dikehendaki berbanding dengan strategi pencarian sasaran berdasarkan PSO dan BA. Oleh itu, EBA yang merupakan kaedah yang dicadangkan mampu untuk membangunkan sasaran pencarian algoritma untuk swarm sistem robotik dan keuntungan pengawal penalaan PD untuk robot beroda mudah alih.

ABSTRACT

Swarm robotics is a multi-robot system which consists of more than two robots working together to accomplish a specific task. Swarm robotics has a huge potentiality to be applied in many sectors such as in agriculture and military due to the availability number of manpower in the system and the capability of robots to execute and accomplish task faster than manual labor. Swarm robotics system consists of at least two robots and can up to hundreds and thousands number of robots in the swarm. Thus, there is an urgent need to monitor and manage the movement of all robots in order to avoid any collision and accident among robots and at the same time to optimize the performance of swarm robotics system. In order to build a swarm robotics system that able to perform target searching task, the system needs to have a robust strategy. However, current solutions of target searching strategy for swarm robotics are unsatisfactory as the solutions are unable to make the robots move efficiently and not arrive at the target position precisely. There are many factors that might contribute to that condition e.g. controller, algorithm and communication. Each robot in the swarm needs to be equipped with good controller, e.g. robust PID controller. Although PID controller is a traditional controller with simple architecture, tuning PID controller to the best gains in order to develop good performance system is difficult. Thus, in order to identify and provide the solution, this research study decided to start the approach with the optimization of PID controller of Wheeled Mobile Robot (WMR). This is because, WMR must able to move effectively from one point to another point in order to execute the target searching task and to perform well in swarm robotics system. The objectives of this research study is 1)to tune and optimize gains of Proportional-Integral-Derivative (PID) controller for wheeled mobile robot (WMR), 2)develop target searching strategy for swarm robotics system and 3)compared the performance of proposed method with the well-established methods, target searching strategy based on Particle Swarm Optimization (PSO) and Bat Algorithm (BA). Extended Bat Algorithm (EBA) has been chosen as swarm intelligent based method for this research study. EBA is the hybrid swarm optimization method of BA with SDA. The weakness of BA to explore the solution appropriately has been overcome with SDA technique. The method of the research study is initiate with tune PID based controller for WMR. Next, adaptive EBA is applied to develop target searching of swarm robotics for two cases i.e. 1) different initial position and varies distance of robots in the swarm and 2) different population of robots in the swarm. Last but not least, the performance of proposed algorithm is compared with PSO and BA. Results obtained from this research study indicates that PD controller tuned by EBA outperformed the performance of PID and PI controller by of 11.00s and 12.11s of rise time for X and Y position respectively, 20.08s and 22.08s settling time X and Y position respectively and no overshoot for both position. By applying the developed robot with PD controller, EBA prove its potentiality to develop the best target searching strategy to the swarm robotics system with 5 number of iterations within 49 seconds. The result is the lowest number of iterations in the shortest of time. The accuracy is 99% to arrive at the desired location compared with target searching strategy based on PSO and BA. Hence, EBA which is the proposed method is able to develop target searching algorithm for swarm robotic system and tuning PD controller gains for wheeled mobile robot.

TABLE OF CONTENT

DECLARATION	
TITLE PAGE	
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	ii
ABSTRAK	iii
ABSTRACT	iv
TABLE OF CONTENT	v
LIST OF TABLES	viii
LIST OF FIGURES	ix
LIST OF SYMBOLS	xi
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	xiii
CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 Research Background	1
1.2 Problem Statement	3
1.3 Objectives	4
1.4 Significance of Study	5
1.5 Scopes and Limitations of Study	5
1.6 Thesis Organization	6
CHAPTER 2 LITERATURE REVIEW	8
2.1 Introduction	8
2.2 Swarm Robotics	10
2.2.1 Swarm Robotics Target Searching	13
2.3 Wheeled Mobile Robot Controller	16
2.3.1 Tuning PID Controller	22

2.4	Bat Algorithm (BA) and Spiral Dynamic Algorithm (SDA)	23
2.5	Summary	25
CHAPTER 3 METHODOLOGY		26
3.1	Introduction	26
3.2	Project Flowchart	27
3.3	Development of Kinematic Model for WMR with PID Controller	31
3.4	Formulation of Extended Bat Algorithm	34
3.4.1	Bat Algorithm	34
3.4.2	Spiral Dynamic Algorithm (SDA)	36
3.4.3	Extended Bat Algorithm	37
3.5	Optimize PID Controller of WMR	40
3.6	Development of Simulation System of Swarm Robotics	44
3.7	Target Searching of Swarm Robotics	44
3.8	Summary	45
CHAPTER 4 RESULTS AND DISCUSSION		47
4.1	Introduction	47
4.2	Experiment Setup	47
4.2.1	PID Controller Design for Wheeled Mobile Robot (WMR)	47
4.2.2	Target Searching Strategy for Swarm Robotics System (SRS)	48
4.3	Analysis on PID controller for Wheeled Mobile Robot	50
4.4	Comparison of PD controller tune and optimized by PSO and BA	55
4.5	Target searching algorithm based on EBA	61
4.5.1	First case: Five homogenous robots with different distances with target	61
4.5.2	Second case: Different number of robots in swarm	68

4.6	Comparison of target searching develop by PSO and BA with proposed method, EBA	69
4.7	Summary	72
CHAPTER 5 CONCLUSION		73
5.1	Introduction	73
5.2	Significant Contribution of the Research	74
5.3	Future Recommendation	74
REFERENCES		75

LIST OF TABLES

Table 3.1	Comparison for BA, SDA and EBA	39
Table 4.1	Parameters control setup for EBA, PSO and BA for phase 1	48
Table 4.2	Parameters control setup for EBA, PSO and BA for phase 2	49
Table 4.3	PID gains value tuned by EBA	51
Table 4.4	Result analysis performance of WMR for X and Y position	53
Table 4.5	Table of weightage values for WS-EBA, WS-PSO and WS-BA	57
Table 4.6	Information of box plot for EBA, BA and PSO for Figure 4.2	58
Table 4.7	PD gains value for comparison with different algorithm	58
Table 4.8	Performance of WMR for X position tuning by WS-EBA, WS-PSO and WS-BA	59
Table 4.9	Performance of WMR for Y position tuning by WS-EBA, WS-PSO and WS-BA	60
Table 4.10	Initial position of all robots in case I	61
Table 4.11	Result of swarm robotics system target searching strategy based on EBA	63
Table 4.12	Result of performance for each robot in the swarm robotics system for X position.	63
Table 4.13	Result of performance for each robot in the swarm robotics system for Y position.	64
Table 4.14	Initial position of robots in the swarm robotics system	68

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1.1	Can A Thousand Tiny Swarming Robots Outsmart Nature? Robotics DeepLook retrieve on 22nd May 2019, www.google.com/swarmrobots	3
Figure 2.1	K-Chart of Swarm Robotics Target Searching Strategy based on Extended Bat Algorithm research study	9
Figure 2.2	Example of robots collision in swarm robotics system (Source: Nazarahari, Khanmirza, & Doostie, 2019)	11
Figure 2.3	A sample run of BEECLUST aggregation developed by Farshad Arvin (Arvin et al., 2017).	12
Figure 2.4	Example of wheeled mobile robot developed by Makerblock Inc	17
Figure 3.1	Project flowchart for phase 1.	29
Figure 3.2	Project flowchart for phase 2.	30
Figure 3.3	Wheeled mobile robot (WMR), mBot.	31
Figure 3.4	Closed loop control system of WMR	33
Figure 3.5	Closed loop kinematic model WMR of mBot with PID controller tuned by EBA.	40
Figure 3.6	Flowchart of multiple objective optimization, weighted-sum Extended Bat Algorithm	42
Figure 3.7	Simulation based design for swarm robotics system	43
Figure 3.8	Flowchart of target searching algorithm for swarm robotics system.	46
Figure 4.1	Convergence curve fitness function for WS-EBA, WS-BA and WS PSO	56
Figure 4.2	Box plot of EBA, BA and PSO for result of fitness values for five times repeatability.	58
Figure 4.3	Graph of X position for optimizing PD controller by using different algorithm	59
Figure 4.4	Graph of Y position for optimizing PD controller by using different algorithm.	60
Figure 4.5	Initial position of robots in swarm with different distance from desired position (x: initial position of robots, bull eye: target/desired position).	62
Figure 4.6	Velocity graph of X position for five robots in swarm robot system perform target searching strategy develop by EBA	64
Figure 4.7	Velocity graph of Y position for five robots in swarm robot system perform target searching strategy develop by EBA.	65
Figure 4.8	Trajectories for five WMR robots with PD controller in swarm robotics system perform a navigation control based on EBA (a) t = 0s, initial position (b) t = 5s, (c) t = 10s, (d) t = 20s, (e) t = 50s, (f) final position	67

Figure 4.9	Performance of swarm robotics system by varies the number of robot in the swarm based on EBA target searching algorithm.	69
Figure 4.10	Performance of efficienecy of swarm robotics system with difference target searching algorithm i.e. PSO, BA and EBA	70
Figure 4.11	Performance of accuracy of swarm robotics system with difference target searching algorithm i.e. PSO, BA and EBA	71

LIST OF SYMBOLS

x	Position robot in x axis
y	Position robot in y axis
θ	Orientation angle of robot
r	Radius of mBot's wheel
ω_r	Right wheel angular velocity
ω_L	Left wheel angular velocity
L	Distance between mBot's wheels
v	Velocity of the agents / robots
ω	Angular velocity of the agents / robots
K_P	Proportional gain
K_I	Integral gain
K_D	Differential gain
v_x	Velocity for x component
v_y	Velocity for y component
$x_{desired}$	Desired / goal position in x axis
$y_{desired}$	Desired / goal position in y axis
x_{actual}	Actual / current position in x axis
y_{actual}	Actual / current position in y axis
f	frequency
$x(agent)$	Agents in algorithm
A	Loudness
p	Pulse rate
$R(\theta)$	Rotation matrix
$r(k)$	Step rate
t	time
i	Number of agents/robot
f_{min}	Minimum frequency
f_{max}	Maximum frequency
β	Random vector
x^*	Current global best
I_n	Identity matrix

k	Number of iteration
ε	Random vector for local movement
x_{new}	New position of agents
x_{old}	Old position of agents
A^+	Mean loudness of all bats
α	Random vector for loudness
γ	Random vector for pulse rate
D	Distance
C_1	Social coefficient
C_2	Cognitive coefficient
P_{best}	Individual best position
g_{best}	Local best position
w	Inertia coefficient
T_r	Rise time
T_s	Settling time
O_s	Overshoot
P	The highest peak
T_p	Time for the highest peak
f_T	Total fitness
f_1	First fitness value
f_2	Second fitness value
W_1	First weightage
W_2	Second weightage
SSE	Steady state error

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

PID	Proportional-Integral-Derivative
PI	Proportional-Integral
PD	Proportional -Derivative
WMR	Wheeled mobile robot
SRS	Swarm Robotics System
EBA	Extended Bat Algorithm
PSO	Particle Swarm Optimization
BA	Bat Algorithm
IAE	Integral Absolute Error
ISE	Integral Sum Error
ITAE	Integral Time Absolute Error
ITSE	Integral Time Sum Error
MIMO	Multi input multi output
SAR	Search and Rescue

REFERENCES

- A. M. Benomair, F. A. B. and M. O. T. (2015). Optimal control based LQR-feedback linearisation for magnetic levitation using improved spiral dynamic algorithm. *20th International Conference on Methods and Models in Automation and Robotics (MMAR)*, 558–562. <https://doi.org/10.1109/MMAR.2015.7283936>
- Agarwal, K., Mahtab, S., Bandyopadhyay, S., & Das Gupta, S. (2013). A Proportional-Integral-Derivative Control Scheme of Mobile Robotic platforms using MATLAB. *IOSR Journal of Electrical and Electronics Engineering*, 7(6), 2278–1676.
- Alakshendra, V., & Chiddarwar, S. S. (2016). A robust adaptive control of mecanum wheel mobile robot: simulation and experimental validation. *2016 IEEE/RSJ International Conference on Intelligent Robots and Systems (IROS)*, 5606–5611. <https://doi.org/10.1109/IROS.2016.7759824>
- Andreev, A. S., & Peregudova, O. A. (2018). Nonlinear Controllers in the Regulation Problem of the Robots *. *IFAC-PapersOnLine*, 51(4), 7–12. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ifacol.2018.06.007>
- Arvin, F., Mendoza, J. L. E., Bird, B., West, A., Watson, S., & Lennox, B. (2017). Mona: an Affordable Mobile Robot for Swarm Robotic Applications. *UK-RAS Conference on 'Robotics and Autonomous Systems*, (June), 1–4.
- Balaji, V., Balaji, M., Chandrasekaran, M., Khan, M. K. A. A., & Elamvazuthi, I. (2015). Optimization of PID Control for High Speed Line Tracking Robots. *Procedia Computer Science*, 76(Iris), 147–154. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.procs.2015.12.329>
- Baral, K. K., Barisal, A. K., & Mohanty, B. (2017). Load frequency controller design via GSO algorithm for nonlinear interconnected power system. *International Conference on Signal Processing, Communication, Power and Embedded System, SCOPES 2016 - Proceedings*, 77, 662–668. <https://doi.org/10.1109/SCOPES.2016.7955524>
- Carlucho, I., De Paula, M., & Acosta, G. G. (2019). Double Q-PID algorithm for mobile robot control. *Expert Systems with Applications*, 137, 292–307. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.eswa.2019.06.066>
- Castillo, O., Neyoy, H., Soria, J., Melin, P., & Valdez, F. (2015). A new approach for dynamic fuzzy logic parameter tuning in Ant Colony Optimization and its application in fuzzy control of a mobile robot. *Applied Soft Computing Journal*, 28, 150–159. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.asoc.2014.12.002>
- Cheng, Z., & Hong, X. (2012). *2012 Fifth International Conference on Intelligent Computation Technology and Automation*. (4), 2–5. <https://doi.org/10.1109/ICICTA.2012.73>

- Chia, K. S. (2018). Ziegler-nichols based proportional-integral-derivative controller for a line tracking robot. *Indonesian Journal of Electrical Engineering and Computer Science*, 9(1), 221–226. <https://doi.org/10.11591/ijeecs.v9.i1.pp221-226>
- Dadgar, M., Jafari, S., & Hamzeh, A. (2016). A PSO-based multi-robot cooperation method for target searching in unknown environments. *Neurocomputing*, 177, 62–74. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.neucom.2015.11.007>
- de Mendonça, R. M., Nedjah, N., & de Macedo Mourelle, L. (2016). Efficient distributed algorithm of dynamic task assignment for swarm robotics. *Neurocomputing*, 172, 345–355. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.neucom.2015.05.117>
- de Rango, F., Palmieri, N., Yang, X. S., & Marano, S. (2017). Swarm robotics in wireless distributed protocol design for coordinating robots involved in cooperative tasks. *Soft Computing*, 1–16. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s00500-017-2819-9>
- de Sá, A. O., Nedjah, N., & de Macedo Mourelle, L. (2016). Distributed efficient localization in swarm robotic systems using swarm intelligence algorithms. *Neurocomputing*, 172, 322–336. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.neucom.2015.03.099>
- de Sá, A. O., Nedjah, N., & Mourelle, L. de M. (2017). Distributed and resilient localization algorithm for Swarm Robotic Systems. *Applied Soft Computing Journal*, 57, 738–750. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.asoc.2016.07.049>
- Deepak, B. B. V. L., Parhi, D. R., & Raju, B. M. V. A. (2014). Advance Particle Swarm Optimization-Based Navigational Controller For Mobile Robot. *Arabian Journal for Science and Engineering*, 39(8), 6477–6487. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s13369-014-1154-z>
- Di Mario, E., Navarro, I., & Martinoli, A. (2013). *The Effect of the Environment in the Synthesis of Robotic Controllers: A Case Study in Multi-Robot Obstacle Avoidance using Distributed Particle Swarm Optimization*. 561–568. <https://doi.org/10.7551/978-0-262-31709-2-ch081>
- Dorigo, M., Birattari, M., & Brambilla, M. (2014). Swarm robotics. *Scholarpedia*, 9(1), 1463. <https://doi.org/10.4249/scholarpedia.1463>
- Fister, I., Yang, X. S., Fong, S., & Zhuang, Y. (2014). Bat algorithm: Recent advances. *CINTI 2014 - 15th IEEE International Symposium on Computational Intelligence and Informatics, Proceedings*, 163–167. <https://doi.org/10.1109/CINTI.2014.7028669>
- Grandi, R., Falconi, R., & Melchiorri, C. (2012). A Navigation Strategy for Multi-Robot Systems Based on Particle Swarm Optimization Techniques. *IFAC Proceedings Volumes*, 45(22), 331–336. <https://doi.org/10.3182/20120905-3-HR-2030.00060>
- Gupta, M., Saxena, D., Kumari, S., & Kaur, D. (2016). Issues and applications of swarm robotics. *International Journal of Research in Engineering, Technology and Science*, VI(July), 1–5.

- Gupta, S., Singh, V. P., Singh, S. P., Prakash, T., & Rathore, N. S. (2016). Elephant herding optimization based PID controller tuning. *International Journal of Advanced Technology and Engineering Exploration*, 3(24), 194–198. <https://doi.org/10.19101/ijatee.2016.324005>
- Hummel, T., Mahmoud, Q. H., & Maha, P. (2012). A configurable swarm robot platform for remote sensing applications. *2012 25th IEEE Canadian Conference on Electrical and Computer Engineering: Vision for a Greener Future, CCECE 2012*. <https://doi.org/10.1109/CCECE.2012.6334894>
- Karahan, O., & Bingül, Z. (2009). PD-fuzzy controller tuned with PSO for robot trajectory control. *IFAC Proceedings Volumes (IFAC-PapersOnline)*, 2(PART 1). <https://doi.org/10.3182/20090921-3-TR-3005.00078>
- Katada, Y., Nishiguchi, A., Moriwaki, K., & Watakabe, R. (2016). Swarm robotic network using Lévy flight in target detection problem. *Artificial Life and Robotics*, 21(3), 295–301. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10015-016-0298-1>
- Krieger, M. J. B., Billeter, J. B., & Keller, L. (2000). Ant-like task allocation and recruitment in cooperative robots. *Nature*, 406(6799), 992–995. <https://doi.org/10.1038/35023164>
- M. R. Hao, R. M. T. R. I. and M. A. A. (2017). Using spiral dynamic algorithm for maximizing power production of wind farm. *2017 International Conference on Applied System Innovation (ICASI)*, 1706–1709. <https://doi.org/10.1109/ICASI.2017.7988266>
- M. R. Hashim and M. O. Tokhi. (2016). Greedy spiral dynamic algorithm with application to controller design. *IEEE Conference on Systems, Process and Control (ICSPC), Bandar Hilir*, 29–32. <https://doi.org/10.1109/SPC.2016.7920698>
- Masar, M. (2013). A biologically inspired swarm robot coordination algorithm for exploration and surveillance. *INES 2013 - IEEE 17th International Conference on Intelligent Engineering Systems, Proceedings*, 271–275. <https://doi.org/10.1109/INES.2013.6632825>
- Miao, Z., Yu, J., Ji, J., & Zhou, J. (2019). Multi-objective region reaching control for a swarm of robots. *Automatica*, 103, 81–87. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.automatica.2019.01.017>
- Mohamed, M. J., & Abbas, M. Y. (2019). Design Interval Type-2 Fuzzy Like (PID) Controller for Trajectory Tracking of Mobile Robot. *Communications, Control & Systems Engineering (IJCCCE)*, 19(3), 1–15. <https://doi.org/10.33103/uot.ijccce.19.3.1>
- Mohan, S., Nandagopal, J. L., & Amritha, S. (2018). Coupled Dynamic Control of Unicycle Robot Using Integral Linear Quadratic Regulator and Sliding Mode Controller. *Materials Today: Proceedings*, 5(1), 1447–1454. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.matpr.2017.11.232>

- Mosaad, A. M., Attia, M. A., & Abdelaziz, A. Y. (2019). Whale optimization algorithm to tune PID and PIDA controllers on AVR system. *Ain Shams Engineering Journal*, (xxxx). <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.asej.2019.07.004>
- Nakisa, B., Rastgoo, N., & Zakree, M. (2018). *Multi-Robot System Using a Hybrid Particle*. 96(July), 4055–4065.
- Nandanwar, M., & Nandanwar, A. (2017). Implementation and Comparison between PSO and BAT Algorithms for Path Planning with Unknown Environment. *International Journal of Latest Technology in Engineering, Management & Applied Science (IJLTEMAS)*, VI(August), 67–72.
- Navabi, H., Sadeghnejad, S., Ramezani, S., & Baltes, J. (2017). Position control of the single spherical wheel mobile robot by using the fuzzy sliding mode controller. *Advances in Fuzzy Systems, 2017*. <https://doi.org/10.1155/2017/2651976>
- Nazarahari, M., Khanmirza, E., & Doostie, S. (2019). Multi-objective multi-robot path planning in continuous environment using an enhanced genetic algorithm. *Expert Systems with Applications*, 115, 106–120. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.eswa.2018.08.008>
- Ouadi, A., Bentarzi, H., & Rezioui, A. (2013). Optimal multiobjective design of digital filters using spiral optimization technique. *SpringerPlus*, 2(1), 1–13. <https://doi.org/10.1186/2193-1801-2-461>
- Pandey, A., Kumar, S., Pandey, K. K., & Parhi, D. R. (2016). Mobile robot navigation in unknown static environments using ANFIS controller. *Perspectives in Science*, 8, 421–423. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.pisc.2016.04.094>
- Pandit, A., & Hingu, B. (2018). Online Tuning of PID controller using Black Box Multi-Objective Optimization and Reinforcement Learning. *IFAC-PapersOnLine*, 51(32), 844–849. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ifacol.2018.11.440>
- Pebrianti, D., Ann, N. Q., Bayuaji, L., Abdullah, N. R. H., Zain, Z. M., & Riyanto, I. (2019). Extended Bat Algorithm (EBA) as an Improved Searching Optimization Algorithm. *Lecture Notes in Electrical Engineering*. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-981-13-3708-6_20
- Pebriati, D. D., & Zulkifli Musa, E. (n.d.). *DEVELOPMENT OF INDOOR LOCALIZATION MOTION TRACKING ALGORITHM BY USING PARTICLE SWARM OPTIMIZATION FOR SWARM ROBOTICS*.
- Peng, X., Zhang, S., & Huang, Y. (2016). Pattern formation in constrained environments: A swarm robot target trapping method. *ICARM 2016 - 2016 International Conference on Advanced Robotics and Mechatronics*, 455–460. <https://doi.org/10.1109/ICARM.2016.7606963>
- Pitonakova, L., Crowder, R., & Bullock, S. (2016). Information flow principles for plasticity in foraging robot swarms. *Swarm Intelligence*, 10(1), 33–63. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11721-016-0118-1>

- Pradhan, R., Majhi, S. K., Pradhan, J. K., & Pati, B. B. (2019). Optimal fractional order PID controller design using Ant Lion Optimizer. *Ain Shams Engineering Journal*, (xxxx). <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.asej.2019.10.005>
- Premkumar, K., & Manikandan, B. V. (2016). Bat algorithm optimized fuzzy PD based speed controller for brushless direct current motor. *Engineering Science and Technology, an International Journal*, 19(2), 818–840. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jestch.2015.11.004>
- Rajesh, K. S., Dash, S. S., & Rajagopal, R. (2019). Hybrid improved firefly-pattern search optimized fuzzy aided PID controller for automatic generation control of power systems with multi-type generations. *Swarm and Evolutionary Computation*, 44(March 2018), 200–211. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.swevo.2018.03.005>
- Robots, W., Almeshal, A. M., Goher, K. M., Nasir, A. N. K., Tokhi, M. O., & Agouri, S. A. (2013). *Hybrid Spiral Dynamic Bacterial Chemotaxis*. (July), 14–17.
- Sahib, M. A., & Ahmed, B. S. (2016). A new multiobjective performance criterion used in PID tuning optimization algorithms. *Journal of Advanced Research*, 7(1), 125–134. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jare.2015.03.004>
- Sakthivelmurugan, E., Senthilkumar, G., Prithiviraj, K. G., & Tinu Devraj, K. R. (2018). Foraging behavior analysis of swarm robotics system. *MATEC Web of Conferences*, 144, 1–10. <https://doi.org/10.1051/mateconf/201714401013>
- Santiago, C., & Chiu, C. S. (2018). Interval Type-2 Fuzzy and PID Dual-Mode Controller for an Autonomous Mobile Robot#. *2018 International Conference on System Science and Engineering, ICSSE 2018*, 1–6. <https://doi.org/10.1109/ICSSE.2018.8520265>
- Sharma, S., Shukla, A., & Tiwari, R. (2016). Multi robot area exploration using nature inspired algorithm. *Biologically Inspired Cognitive Architectures*, 18, 80–94. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.bica.2016.09.003>
- Singh, K., Vasant, P., Elamvazuthi, I., & Kannan, R. (2015). PID tuning of servo motor using bat algorithm. *Procedia Computer Science*, 60(1), 1798–1808. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.procs.2015.08.290>
- Solihin Mahmud Iwan, Tack Lee Fook, K. M. L. (2011). Tuning of PID Controller Using Particle Swarm Optimization (PSO). *Proceeding of the International Conference on Advanced Science, Engineering and Information Technology*, 458–461. <https://doi.org/10.18517/ijaseit.1.4.93>
- Suárez, P., Iglesias, A., & Gálvez, A. (2018). Make Robots Be Bats : Specializing Specializing Robotic Swarms to the Bat Algorithm. *Swarm and Evolutionary Computation BASE DATA*. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.swevo.2018.01.005>

- Suarin, N. A. S., Pebrianti, D., Ann, N. Q., Bayuaji, L., Syafrullah, M., & Riyanto, I. (2019). Performance Evaluation of PID Controller Parameters Gain Optimization for Wheel Mobile Robot Based on Bat Algorithm and Particle Swarm Optimization. *Lecture Notes in Electrical Engineering*. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-981-13-3708-6_27
- Sujay, H. S., Suman, R., Chaithanya, S., Narayanan, S., & Shamanth, U. (2018). *Tuning and Analysis of PID Controllers Using Soft Computing Techniques*. 5(3), 67–71.
- Tan, Y., & Zheng, Z. (2013). ScienceDirect Research Advance in Swarm Robotics. *Defence Technology*, 9(1), 18–39. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.dt.2013.03.001>
- Tarapore, D., Christensen, A. L., & Timmis, J. (2017). Generic, scalable and decentralized fault detection for robot swarms. *PLoS ONE*, 12(8), 1–29. <https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0182058>
- Wang, D., Kwok, N. M., Fang, G., Jia, X., & Li, F. (2010). Ants based Control of Swarm Robots for bushfire fighting. *Proceedings - International Conference on Artificial Intelligence and Computational Intelligence, AICI 2010*, 1, 528–532. <https://doi.org/10.1109/AICI.2010.116>
- Yang, B., Ding, Y., Jin, Y., & Hao, K. (2015). Self-organized swarm robot for target search and trapping inspired by bacterial chemotaxis. *Robotics and Autonomous Systems*, 72, 83–92. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.robot.2015.05.001>
- Yang, X. S. (2010). A new metaheuristic Bat-inspired Algorithm. *Studies in Computational Intelligence*, 284, 65–74. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-642-12538-6_6
- Ye, Y., Yin, C. B., Gong, Y., & Zhou, J. jing. (2017). Position control of nonlinear hydraulic system using an improved PSO based PID controller. *Mechanical Systems and Signal Processing*, 83, 241–259. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ymsp.2016.06.010>
- Zan, Y., Xue, S., Zeng, J., & Du, J. (2012). Target position estimation aided swarm robotic search under conditions of relative localization mechanism. *Proceedings - 2012 International Conference on Computing, Measurement, Control and Sensor Network, CMCSN 2012*, 183–186. <https://doi.org/10.1109/CMCSN.2012.47>