

Zero waste system comprised of fixed bed biofilm reactor, ozone oxidation, and  
electrodialysis desalination for wastewater sustainability

Sajjad Al-Amshawee <sup>a,\*</sup>, Mohd Yusri Bin Mohd Yunus <sup>a,b</sup>, Rosli Bin Mohd Yunus <sup>a</sup>, Joan G.  
Lynam <sup>c</sup>

<sup>a</sup> Faculty of Chemical and Process Engineering Technology, Universiti Malaysia Pahang,  
26300 Pahang, Malaysia

<sup>b</sup> Earth Resource and Sustainability Centre (ERAS), Universiti Malaysia Pahang, 26300  
Pahang, Malaysia

<sup>c</sup> Department of Chemical Engineering, Louisiana Tech University, P.O. Box 10348, 600  
Dan Reneau Drive, Ruston, LA 71272, USA

Corresponding author: sajjad.hillawi@hotmail.com (Sajjad Al-Amshawee)

### Abstract

Wastewater processing mediates industrial and domestic wastes and supports societal, ecological, and economic values. Unfortunately, no single process alone is able to sustain wastewater processing. Thus, a Zero Waste System was devised combining fixed bed biofilm reactor (FBBR), ozonation, and electrodialysis to treat palm oil mill effluent (POME). The POME pollutants were biodegraded into smaller molecules inside the FBBR. This bioreactor was fully packed with Micro Media, Ultra Media, Kaldnes K1 micro, and green ammonia absorption stones. During the biodegradation, biogas and biomass were generated as valuable products. Ozonation oxidized all the FBBR effluents at an ozone dose of 15 mg/L for 24 h before being discharged for electrodialysis because bioremediation definitely does not decompose all suspended solids. Then, the electrodialysis received the ozonated effluents and

- [17] Y. Ahmed, Z. Yaakob, P. Akhtar, K. Sopian, Production of biogas and performance evaluation of existing treatment processes in palm oil mill effluent (POME), *Renew. Sustain. Energy Rev.* 42 (2015) 1260–1278. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.rser.2014.10.073>.
- [18] J. Martí-Herrero, R. Alvarez, M.R. Rojas, L. Aliaga, R. Céspedes, J. Carbonell, Improvement through low cost biofilm carrier in anaerobic tubular digestion in cold climate regions, *Bioresour. Technol.* 167 (2014) 87–93. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biortech.2014.05.115>.
- [19] S. Pandey, S. Sarkar, Anaerobic treatment of wastewater using a two-stage packed-bed reactor containing polyvinyl alcohol gel beads as biofilm carrier, *J. Environ. Chem. Eng.* 5 (2017) 1575–1585. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jece.2017.02.013>.
- [20] C.L. Souza, C.A.L. Chernicharo, S.F. Aquino, Quantification of dissolved methane in UASB reactors treating domestic wastewater under different operating conditions, *Water Sci. Technol.* 64 (2011) 2259–2264. <https://doi.org/10.2166/wst.2011.695>.
- [21] A. Alvarado-Lassman, E. Rustrián, M.A. García-Alvarado, G.C. Rodríguez-Jiménez, E. Houbron, Brewery wastewater treatment using anaerobic inverse fluidized bed reactors, *Bioresour. Technol.* 99 (2008) 3009–3015. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biortech.2007.06.022>.
- [22] C.A.L. Chernicharo, J.B. van Lier, A. Noyola, T. Bressani Ribeiro, Anaerobic sewage treatment: state of the art, constraints and challenges, *Rev. Environ. Sci. Biotechnol.* (2015). <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11157-015-9377-3>.
- [23] K. Dutta, C.Y. Tsai, W.H. Chen, J.G. Lin, Effect of carriers on the performance of anaerobic sequencing batch biofilm reactor treating synthetic municipal wastewater, *Int. Biodeterior. Biodegrad.* 95 (2014) 84–88. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ibiod.2014.04.021>.
- [24] Y.S. Wong, T.T. Teng, S.A. Ong, N. Morad, M. Rafatullah, Suspended growth kinetic analysis on biogas generation from newly isolated anaerobic bacterial communities for palm oil mill effluent at mesophilic temperature, *RSC Adv.* 4 (2014) 64659–64667. <https://doi.org/10.1039/c4ra08483g>.
- [25] I.D. Manariotis, S.G. Grigoropoulos, Anaerobic treatment of low-strength wastewater in a biofilm reactor, *J. Environ. Sci. Heal. - Part A Toxic/Hazardous Subst. Environ. Eng.* 38 (2003) 2057–2068. <https://doi.org/10.1081/ESE-120023332>.
- [26] P. Izadi, P. Izadi, A. Eldyasti, R. Hawkes, Enhancement of Anaerobic Digestion Using Particulate Growth Systems, *Bioenergy Res.* 11 (2018) 516–527. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s12155-018-9918-z>.
- [27] J. Pantoja-Filho, R. Moura, G. Peixoto, G. Mockaitis, D. Simoes, A. Barana, E. Foresti, A comparative study of autotrophic and heterotrophic denitrification using reduced sulphur and acetate as electron donors, in: 13th World Congr. Anaerob. Dig. Recover. Resour. World, Spain, 2013.
- [28] H.C. Kim, J. Shin, S. Won, J.Y. Lee, S.K. Maeng, K.G. Song, Membrane distillation combined with an anaerobic moving bed biofilm reactor for treating municipal wastewater, *Water Res.* 71 (2015) 97–106. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.watres.2014.12.048>.
- [29] M.J. Chin, P.E. Poh, B.T. Tey, E.S. Chan, K.L. Chin, Biogas from palm oil mill effluent (POME): Opportunities and challenges from Malaysia's perspective, *Renew. Sustain. Energy Rev.* 26 (2013) 717–726. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.rser.2013.06.008>.
- [30] Y. Mao, X. Quan, H. Zhao, Y. Zhang, S. Chen, T. Liu, W. Quan, Accelerated startup of moving bed biofilm process with novel electrophilic suspended biofilm carriers, *Chem. Eng. J.* 315 (2017) 364–372. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cej.2017.01.041>.
- [31] H. Zhang, R. Du, S. Cao, S. Wang, Y. Peng, Mechanisms and characteristics of biofilm formation via novel DEAMOX system based on sequencing biofilm batch

- reactor, J. Biosci. Bioeng. 127 (2019) 206–212. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbiosc.2018.07.026>.
- [32] Kuenen J. G., Anammox bacteria: from discovery to application, *Nat. Rev. Microbiol.* (2008) 320–326.
- [33] A.-A. Sajjad, M.Y.B.M. Yunus, D.-V.N. Vo, N.H. Tran, Biocarriers for biofilm immobilization in wastewater treatments: a review, *Environ. Chem. Lett.* (2020). <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10311-020-01049-y>.
- [34] J. Martín-Pascual, C. López-López, A. Cerdá, J. González-López, E. Hontoria, J.M. Poyatos, Comparative kinetic study of carrier type in a moving bed system applied to organic matter removal in urban wastewater treatment, *Water. Air. Soil Pollut.* 223 (2012) 1699–1712. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11270-011-0976-5>.
- [35] R.A. Bezerra, J.A.D. Rodrigues, S.M. Ratusznei, M. Zaiat, E. Foresti, W. Borzani, Performance of anaerobic sequencing batch biofilm reactor submitted to different influent volume feeds and cycle time periods maintaining organic loading, *Appl. Biochem. Biotechnol.* 126 (2005) 189–203. <https://doi.org/10.1385/ABAB:126:3:189>.
- [36] F. Wang, L. Zhou, J. Zhao, The performance of biocarrier containing zinc nanoparticles in biofilm reactor for treating textile wastewater, *Process Biochem.* 74 (2018) 125–131. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.procbio.2018.08.022>.
- [37] C. Li, S. Felz, M. Wagner, S. Lackner, H. Horn, Investigating biofilm structure developing on carriers from lab-scale moving bed biofilm reactors based on light microscopy and optical coherence tomography, *Bioresour. Technol.* (2016). <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biortech.2015.10.013>.
- [38] P. Izadi, P. Izadi, A. Elyasti, R. Hawkes, Enhancement of Anaerobic Digestion Using Particulate Growth Systems, *Bioenergy Res.* (2018). <https://doi.org/10.1007/s12155-018-9918-z>.
- [39] R. Dai, X. Chen, C. Ma, X. Xiang, G. Li, Insoluble/immobilized redox mediators for catalyzing anaerobic bio-reduction of contaminants, *Rev. Environ. Sci. Biotechnol.* 15 (2016) 379–409. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11157-016-9404-z>.
- [40] N. Dizge, B. Tansel, B. Sizirici, Process intensification with a hybrid system: A tubular packed bed bioreactor with immobilized activated sludge culture coupled with membrane filtration, *Chem. Eng. Process. Process Intensif.* (2011). <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cep.2011.06.007>.
- [41] G. Zellner, H. Diekmann, U. Austermann-Haun, C.F. Seyfried, Scanning electron microscopy of biofilm development in anaerobic fixed-bed reactors: Influence of the inoculum, *Biotechnol. Lett.* 16 (1994) 315–320. <https://doi.org/10.1007/BF00134632>.
- [42] L. Hall Stoodley, C.W. Keevil, H.M. Lappin Scott, *Mycobacterium fortuitum* and *Mycobacterium chelonae* biofilm formation under high and low nutrient conditions, *Int. J. Lepr. Other Mycobact. Dis.* 67 (1999) 513. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2672.1998.tb05284.x>.
- [43] L. Chu, J. Wang, F. Quan, X.H. Xing, L. Tang, C. Zhang, Modification of polyurethane foam carriers and application in a moving bed biofilm reactor, *Process Biochem.* 49 (2014) 1979–1982. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.procbio.2014.07.018>.
- [44] M. Garrido-Baserba, P. Asvapathanagul, G.W. McCarthy, T.E. Gocke, B.H. Olson, H.D. Park, A. Al-Omari, S. Murthy, C.B. Bott, B. Wett, J.D. Smeraldi, A.R. Shaw, D. Rosso, Linking biofilm growth to fouling and aeration performance of fine-pore diffuser in activated sludge, *Water Res.* 90 (2016) 317–328. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.watres.2015.12.011>.
- [45] S. Fukuzaki, N. Nishio, S. Nagai, The use of polyurethane foam for microbial retention in methanogenic fermentation of propionate, *Appl. Microbiol. Biotechnol.* 34 (1990) 408–413. <https://doi.org/10.1007/BF00170070>.

- [46] L. Wang, Y. Li, L. Wang, H. Zhang, M. Zhu, P. Zhang, X. Zhu, Extracellular polymeric substances affect the responses of multi-species biofilms in the presence of sulfamethizole, *Environ. Pollut.* (2018). <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envpol.2017.12.060>.
- [47] C. Acar, I. Dincer, Experimental investigation and analysis of a hybrid photoelectrochemical hydrogen production system, *Int. J. Hydrogen Energy.* 42 (2017) 2504–2511. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijhydene.2016.03.099>.
- [48] S. Fukuzaki, N. Nishio, S. Nagai, The use of polyurethane foam for microbial retention in methanogenic fermentation of propionate, *Appl. Microbiol. Biotechnol.* (1990). <https://doi.org/10.1007/BF00170070>.
- [49] T.J. Wan, S.M. Shen, H.Y. Hwang, H.Y. Fang, Soybean Oil Biodegradation Using *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* Attached on Porous Ceramic or Polyurethane, *Arab. J. Sci. Eng.* 38 (2013) 1025–1030. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s13369-012-0344-9>.
- [50] Q. Zhang, X. Zhu, X. Zhao, H. Chen, W. Li, H. Zhu, Effects of coupling biofilm on the production of short-chain fatty acids (SCFAs) in sludge anaerobic fermentation, *Biomass Convers. Biorefinery.* (2019). <https://doi.org/10.1007/s13399-019-00576-1>.
- [51] N. Dizge, B. Tansel, B. Sizirici, Process intensification with a hybrid system: A tubular packed bed bioreactor with immobilized activated sludge culture coupled with membrane filtration, *Chem. Eng. Process. Process Intensif.* 50 (2011) 766–772. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cep.2011.06.007>.
- [52] M. Ahmad, S. Liu, N. Mahmood, A. Mahmood, M. Ali, M. Zheng, J. Ni, Effects of porous carrier size on biofilm development, microbial distribution and nitrogen removal in microaerobic bioreactors, *Bioresour. Technol.* (2017). <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biortech.2017.03.076>.
- [53] G. Hwang, T. Dong, M.S. Islam, Z. Sheng, L.A. Pérez-Estrada, Y. Liu, M. Gamal El-Din, The impacts of ozonation on oil sands process-affected water biodegradability and biofilm formation characteristics in bioreactors, *Bioresour. Technol.* (2013). <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biortech.2012.12.005>.
- [54] L. Zhang, Z. Xing, H. Zhang, Z. Li, X. Wu, X. Zhang, Y. Zhang, W. Zhou, High thermostable ordered mesoporous SiO<sub>2</sub>-TiO<sub>2</sub> coated circulating-bed biofilm reactor for unpredictable photocatalytic and biocatalytic performance, *Appl. Catal. B Environ.* 180 (2016) 521–529. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.apcatb.2015.07.002>.
- [55] H. Zhang, Y. Wang, J. Wang, Y. He, Mechanism of bisphenol A removal by a submerged membrane bioreactor in the treatment of synthetic municipal sewage: staged analyses, *Desalin. Water Treat.* 57 (2016) 12364–12374. <https://doi.org/10.1080/19443994.2015.1046948>.
- [56] J. Páca, J. Páca, A. Kostecková, M. Stiborová, M. Sobotka, A.M. Gerrard, C.R. Soccol, Continuous aerobic phenol degradation by defined mixed immobilized culture in packed bed reactors, *Folia Microbiol. (Praha).* 50 (2005) 301–308. <https://doi.org/10.1007/BF02931410>.
- [57] S. Tarjányi-Szikora, J. Oláh, M. Makó, G. Palkó, K. Barkács, G. Záray, Comparison of different granular solids as biofilm carriers, *Microchem. J.* 107 (2013) 101–107. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.microc.2012.05.027>.
- [58] Y. Zhao, D. Liu, W. Huang, Y. Yang, M. Ji, L.D. Nghiem, Q.T. Trinh, N.H. Tran, Insights into biofilm carriers for biological wastewater treatment processes: Current state-of-the-art, challenges, and opportunities, *Bioresour. Technol.* 288 (2019) 121619. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biortech.2019.121619>.
- [59] U. Manonmani, K. Joseph, Granulation of anammox microorganisms for autotrophic nitrogen removal from wastewater, *Environ. Chem. Lett.* (2018). <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10311-018-0732-9>.
- [60] N. Mao, H. Ren, J. Geng, L. Ding, K. Xu, Engineering application of anaerobic

- ammonium oxidation process in wastewater treatment, *World J. Microbiol. Biotechnol.* 33 (2017) 0. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11274-017-2313-7>.
- [61] F. Han, W. Ye, D. Wei, W. Xu, B. Du, Q. Wei, Simultaneous nitrification-denitrification and membrane fouling alleviation in a submerged biofilm membrane bioreactor with coupling of sponge and biodegradable PBS carrier, *Bioresour. Technol.* 270 (2018) 156–165. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biortech.2018.09.026>.
- [62] A. Mudhoo, S.K. Sharma, Microwave irradiation technology in waste sludge and wastewater treatment research, *Crit. Rev. Environ. Sci. Technol.* (2011). <https://doi.org/10.1080/10643380903392767>.
- [63] S. Tabassum, Q. Ji, C. Li, L. Chi, C.G. Silva, A.F.A. Ajlouni, C. Chu, R. Alnoman, Z. Zhang, Treatment of centrifugal mother liquid of polyvinyl chloride by internal circulation aerobic biofilm reactor: Lab to plant scale system, *J. Clean. Prod.* 200 (2018) 568–577. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2018.07.276>.
- [64] M. Mörsche, Anaerobic degradability of alcohol ethoxylates and related non-ionic surfactants, *Biodegradation.* 15 (2004) 327–336. <https://doi.org/10.1023/B:BIOD.0000042188.10331.61>.
- [65] V. Krasňan, R. Stloukal, M. Rosenberg, M. Rebroš, Immobilization of cells and enzymes to LentiKats®, *Appl. Microbiol. Biotechnol.* 100 (2016) 2535–2553. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s00253-016-7283-4>.
- [66] A. Tawfik, N. Badr, E.A. Taleb, W. El-Senousy, Sewage treatment in an up-flow anaerobic sponge reactor followed by moving bed biofilm reactor based on polyurethane carrier material, *Desalin. Water Treat.* 37 (2012) 350–358. <https://doi.org/10.1080/19443994.2012.661291>.
- [67] K.Y. Park, S.K. Maeng, K.H. Ahn, K. Lee, O.K. Choi, J.W. Lee, Carbon dioxide injection method for enhancing hydrogenotrophic denitrification of secondary wastewater effluent in fixed bed reactor, *Biotechnol. Bioprocess Eng.* 18 (2013) 326–332. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s12257-012-0537-9>.
- [68] J.P. Bassin, I.N. Dias, S.M.S. Cao, E. Senra, Y. Laranjeira, M. Dezotti, Effect of increasing organic loading rates on the performance of moving-bed biofilm reactors filled with different support media: Assessing the activity of suspended and attached biomass fractions, *Process Saf. Environ. Prot.* 100 (2016) 131–141. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.psep.2016.01.007>.
- [69] A. Boley, W.R. Müller, G. Haider, Biodegradable polymers as solid substrate and biofilm carrier for denitrification in recirculated aquaculture systems, *Aquac. Eng.* 22 (2000) 75–85. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0144-8609\(00\)00033-9](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0144-8609(00)00033-9).
- [70] B. Tang, C. Yu, L. Bin, Y. Zhao, X. Feng, S. Huang, F. Fu, J. Ding, C. Chen, P. Li, Q. Chen, Essential factors of an integrated moving bed biofilm reactor-membrane bioreactor: Adhesion characteristics and microbial community of the biofilm, *Bioresour. Technol.* 211 (2016) 574–583. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biortech.2016.03.136>.
- [71] Y. Jiang, A. Khan, H. Huang, Y. Tian, X. Yu, Q. Xu, L. Mou, J. Lv, P. Zhang, P. Liu, L. Deng, X. Li, Using nano-attapulgite clay compounded hydrophilic urethane foams (AT/HUFs) as biofilm support enhances oil-refinery wastewater treatment in a biofilm membrane bioreactor, *Sci. Total Environ.* 646 (2019) 606–617. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2018.07.149>.
- [72] Z. Derakhshan, M.T. Ghaneian, A.H. Mahvi, G. Oliveri Conti, M. Faramarzian, M. Dehghani, M. Ferrante, A new recycling technique for the waste tires reuse, *Environ. Res.* 158 (2017) 462–469. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envres.2017.07.003>.
- [73] H. Särkkä, A. Bhatnagar, M. Sillanpää, Recent developments of electro-oxidation in water treatment - A review, *J. Electroanal. Chem.* 754 (2015) 46–56.

- [https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jelechem.2015.06.016.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jelechem.2015.06.016)
- [74] T. Jäger, J. Alexander, S. Kirchen, A. Dötsch, A. Wieland, C. Hiller, T. Schwartz, Live-dead discrimination analysis, qPCR assessment for opportunistic pathogens, and population analysis at ozone wastewater treatment plants, Environ. Pollut. 232 (2018) 571–579. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envpol.2017.09.089>.
- [75] S. bing He, G. Xue, B. zhen Wang, Activated sludge ozonation to reduce sludge production in membrane bioreactor (MBR), J. Hazard. Mater. (2006). <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jhazmat.2005.12.002>.
- [76] S. Al-Amshawee, M.Y.B.M. Yunus, A.A.M. Azoddein, D.G. Hassell, I.H. Dakhil, H.A. Hasan, Electrodialysis desalination for water and wastewater: A review, Chem. Eng. J. 380 (2020). <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cej.2019.122231>.
- [77] P.A. Sosa-Fernandez, J.W. Post, M.S. Ramdlan, F.A.M. Leermakers, H. Bruning, H.H.M. Rijnaarts, Improving the performance of polymer-flooding produced water electrodialysis through the application of pulsed electric field, Desalination. (2020). <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.desal.2020.114424>.
- [78] A. Dzionaek, D. Wojcieszynska, U. Guzik, Natural carriers in bioremediation: A review, Electron. J. Biotechnol. 23 (2016) 28–36. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ejbt.2016.07.003>.
- [79] Wepa, Water Environment Partnership in Asia, (n.d.). [http://www.wepadb.net/policies/law/malaysia/eq\\_surface.htm](http://www.wepadb.net/policies/law/malaysia/eq_surface.htm).