

**WASTEWATER TREATMENT PROCESS: A
MODIFIED MODEL FOR OXIDATION POND**

SYAFIQAH HANIS BINTI MOHD FAUZI

MASTER OF SCIENCE

UNIVERSITI MALAYSIA PAHANG



SUPERVISOR'S DECLARATION

I hereby declare that I have checked this thesis, and in my opinion, this thesis is adequate in terms of scope and quality for the award of the degree of Master of Science.

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Norazaliza' or a similar variation.

(Supervisor's Signature)

Full Name : TS DR NORAZALIZA BINTI MOHD JAMIL

Position : SENIOR LECTURER

Date : 29/11/2021



STUDENT'S DECLARATION

I hereby declare that the work in this thesis is based on my original work except for quotations and citations which have been duly acknowledged. I also declare that it has not been previously or concurrently submitted for any other degree at Universiti Malaysia Pahang or any other institutions.



(Student's Signature)

Full Name : SYAFIQAH HANIS BINTI MOHD FAUZI

ID Number : MSE20002

Date : 25/11/2021

**WASTEWATER TREATMENT PROCESS: A MODIFIED MODEL FOR
OXIDATION POND**

SYAFIQAH HANIS BINTI MOHD FAUZI

Thesis submitted in fulfillment of the requirements
for the award of the degree of
Master of Science

Centre for Mathematical Sciences
UNIVERSITI MALAYSIA PAHANG

DECEMBER 2021

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Praise to Allah, with His will, I was able to complete my thesis with the title of “Wastewater Treatment Process: A Modified Model for Oxidation Pond”. I would like to extend my heartfelt gratitude and appreciation to my respected supervisor, Ts Dr Norazaliza binti Mohd Jamil. My supervisor whose expertise, consistent guidance, ample time spent, and consistent advice have helped me to make this thesis completely successful. Her encouragement and support have been helpful in my studies and writing this thesis. Other than that, the greatest appreciation goes to Universiti Malaysia Pahang for giving me the opportunity to further my studies here.

Lastly, I would like to express my deepest appreciation to my parents, Mohd Fauzi bin Rashid and Rafi'ah binti Mohd Tahir for providing me their endless moral support, encouragement, and prayers, which have made it possible for me to complete this thesis.

ABSTRAK

Rawatan air sisa bertujuan untuk menghilangkan pepejal terampai sebanyak mungkin sehingga sampai ke sisa air, yang dikenali sebagai efluen, sebelum dilepaskan ke persekitaran. Kaedah kolam pengoksidaan telah terbukti berjaya dalam proses rawatan air sisa kerana kos pembinaan dan penyelenggaraannya yang rendah. Matlamat penyelidikan ini adalah untuk mengkaji degradasi bahan pencemar air sisa melalui sistem rawatan kolam pengoksidaan. Tujuan tesis ini adalah untuk memaparkan hubungan antara kepekatan bakteria, iaitu fototrofik dan koliform, permintaan oksigen kimia (COD), dan oksigen terlarut (DO). Selain itu, antara muka pengguna grafik (GUI) yang meramalkan proses rawatan air sisa di kolam pengoksidaan telah dibangunkan dalam kajian ini. Model yang diubahsuai yang terdiri daripada satu set persamaan pembezaan biasa (ODE) dikembangkan dengan memasukkan persamaan Monod untuk COD. Model ini diselesaikan secara berangka dengan menggunakan kaedah Runge-Kutta urutan ke-4 dan teknik pemasangan parameter iaitu algoritma Nelder-Mead simplex yang disertakan dalam perisian MATLAB. Untuk mengesahkan keputusan, perbandingan antara model dan data eksperimen telah dijalankan dan diukur dengan menggunakan ralat kuasa dua min punca (RMSE). Hasilnya, model matematik yang diubah menunjukkan RMSE yang lebih rendah berbanding dengan model yang sedia ada. Oleh kerana nilai RMSE yang lebih rendah menunjukkan kesesuaian yang lebih baik, model yang diubah suai mempunyai penghampiran yang lebih baik daripada model yang sedia ada berdasarkan perubahan jumlah kepekatan di kolam pengoksidaan untuk menghasilkan air yang berkualiti.

ABSTRACT

Wastewater treatment aims to eliminate suspended solids as many as possible before the remaining water, known as effluent, is released into the environment. Oxidation pond methods have practically been proven successful for the wastewater treatment process due to their low construction and maintenance costs. This study aims to investigate the degradation of wastewater pollutants through an oxidation pond treatment system. The purpose of this thesis is to present the relationship between the concentration of bacteria, which are phototrophic and coliform, chemical oxygen demand (COD), and dissolved oxygen (DO) in the form of modified mathematical model. Additionally, a Graphical User Interface (GUI) which predicting the wastewater treatment process in an oxidation pond is developed in this study. A modified model comprising of a set of ordinary differential equations (ODE) is proposed by incorporating Monod equation for COD. The model has been solved numerically by using the 4th order Runge-Kutta method and a parameter fitting technique namely Nelder-Mead simplex algorithm embedded in MATLAB software. To validate the result, a comparison between the model and the experimental data was carried out and measured by using the root mean squared error (RMSE). As a result, the modified mathematical model demonstrated lower RMSE as compared to the existing model. Since a lower RMSE value indicates better fit, the modified model provided a better approximation than an existing model based on the changes of the amount of concentration in the oxidation pond to produce good quality of water.

TABLE OF CONTENT

DECLARATION	
TITLE PAGE	
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	ii
ABSTRAK	iii
ABSTRACT	iv
TABLE OF CONTENT	v
LIST OF TABLES	viii
LIST OF FIGURES	ix
LIST OF SYMBOLS	x
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	xi
CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION OF RESEARCH	12
1.1 Introduction	12
1.2 Research Background	12
1.3 Problem statement	14
1.4 Research Objectives	15
1.5 Research Scope	15
1.6 Research Significance	16
1.7 Thesis Outline	16
CHAPTER 2 LITERATURE REVIEW	18
2.1 Introduction	18
2.2 Oxidation Pond	18
2.2.1 Treatment Process in Oxidation Pond	19
2.3 Parameter Variation in Oxidation Pond	21

2.3.1	Phototrophic Bacteria (PSB)	23
2.3.2	Coliform Bacteria	24
2.3.3	Chemical Oxygen Demand (COD)	24
2.3.4	Dissolved Oxygen (DO)	25
2.4	Symbiotic Relationship in Oxidation Pond	25
2.5	Mathematical Modelling of Wastewater Treatment	27
2.6	Monod Equation	29
2.7	Summary	29
CHAPTER 3 MATHEMATICAL MODELLING		30
3.1	Introduction	30
3.2	Mathematical Modelling by Ockendon et al. (2014)	30
3.3	Modified Mathematical Modelling	33
3.4	Data Description	34
3.5	Numerical Solution	35
3.5.1	Runge-Kutta Method	36
3.6	Parameter Estimation	40
3.6.1	Nelder-Mead Simplex Algorithm	40
3.6.2	Objective Function	42
3.7	Research Flow	42
3.8	Summary	45
CHAPTER 4 RESULTS AND DISCUSSION		46
4.1	Introduction	46
4.2	Simulated Result	46
4.3	Model Validation	54

4.4	Graphical User Interface (GUI)	58
4.5	Summary	60
CHAPTER 5 CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATION		61
5.1	Introduction	61
5.2	Conclusion	61
5.3	Recommendations	62
REFERENCES		63
APPENDIX A		71
APPENDIX B		83
APPENDIX C		99
APPENDIX D		100

REFERENCES

- Abdel-Shafy, H. I., & Salem, M. A. (2007). Efficiency of oxidation ponds for wastewater treatment in Egypt. In *In Wastewater Reuse—Risk Assessment, Decision-Making and Environmental Security* (pp. pp. 175-184). Springer, Dordrecht.
- Abdulkareem, A. (2004). Modeling of microbial growth in a wastewater treatment plant: a case study of textile industry in Kaduna, Nigeria. *AU Journal of Technology*, 8, 45-54.
- Abdullah, A. R. (1995). Environmental pollution in Malaysia: trends and prospects. *TRAC trends in analytical chemistry*, 14(5), 191-198.
- Alam, T. (2015). Estimation of Chemical Oxygen Demand in WasteWater using UV-VIS Spectroscopy (Doctoral dissertation, Applied Sciences: School of Mechatronic Systems Engineering).
- Aniyikaiye, T. E., Oluseyi, T., Odiyo, J. O., & Edokpayi, J. N. (2019). Physico-chemical analysis of wastewater discharge from selected paint industries in Lagos, Nigeria. *International journal of environmental research and public health*, 16(7), 1235.
- Ansa, E. D. (2013). The removal of faecal coliforms in waste stabilization pond systems and eutrophic lakes. *IHE Delft Institute for Water Education*.
- Atshan, S. M., Hamoud, A. A., Sharif, A. A., & Ghadle, K. P. (2020). Mathematical Model for the Concentration of Pollution and River Water Quality Modelling. *Journal of Xidian University*, 1272-1280.
- Banda, C. G., Sleigh, P. A., & Mara, D. D. (2006). CFD-based design of waste stabilization ponds: Significance of wind velocity. *7th IWA Specialist Group Conf. on Waste Stabilization Ponds, Asian Institute of Technology, Bangkok, Thailand*.
- Banerjee, I., Nguyen, B., Garousi, V., & Memon, A. (2013). Graphical user interface (GUI) testing: Systematic mapping and repository. *Information and Software Technology*, 55(10), 1679-1694.
- Beck, J. V., & Arnold, K. J. (1977). *Parameter estimation in engineering and science*. James Beck.
- Beck, M. B., & Young, P. C. (1975). A dynamic model for DO—BOD relationships in a non-tidal stream. *Water Research*, 9(9), 769-776.

- Bej, A. K., Steffan, R. J., DiCesare, J., Haff, L., & Atlas, R. M. (1990). Detection of coliform bacteria in water by polymerase chain reaction and gene probes. *Applied and environmental microbiology*, 56(2), 307-314.
- Beran, B., & Kargi, F. (2005). A dynamic mathematical model for wastewater stabilization ponds. *Ecological Modelling*, 181(1), 39-57.
- Bhateria, R., & Jain, D. (2016). Water quality assessment of lake water: a review. *Sustainable Water Resources Management*, 2(2), 161-173.
- Bian, J., & Li, X. (1992). Research on the operational regularity and management technology of stabilization ponds. *Water Science and Technology*, 26(7-8), 1749-1757.
- Bryan R. S., William E. S., & Tom M. (2006). Pond Facts #5 Water Quality Concerns for Ponds. *The Pennsylvania State University*.
- Butler, E., Hung, Y. T., Al Ahmad, M. S., Yeh, R. Y. L., Liu, R. L. H., & Fu, Y. P. (2017). Oxidation pond for municipal wastewater treatment. *Applied water science*, 7(1), 31-51.
- Cameron, S. & Clark, S. (2017). *Waste Stabilisation Ponds: Design and operation*. Good Practice Guide.
- Caumette, P. (1993). *Ecology and physiology of phototrophic bacteria and sulfate-reducing bacteria in marine salterns*. Experientia, 49(6), 473-481.
- Chapman, D. V. (1996). *Water quality assessments: a guide to the use of biota, sediments and water in environmental monitoring*. CRC Press.
- Chen, J., Wei, J., Ma, C., Yang, Z., Li, Z., Yang, X., & Zhang, C. (2020). Photosynthetic bacteria-based technology is a potential alternative to meet sustainable wastewater treatment requirement? *Environment international*, 137, 105417.
- Çokgör, E. U., Sözen, S., Orhon, D., & Henze, M. (1998). Respirometric analysis of activated sludge behaviour—I. Assessment of the readily biodegradable substrate. *Water Research*, 32(2), 461-475.
- Council, T. R. (2015). New Plymouth District Council Inglewood Oxidation Ponds System Monitoring Programme Annual Report 2014-2015. *TRC Technical Report 2015-18*.
- Craggs, R. J., Zwart, A., Nagels, J. W., & Davies-Colley, R. J. . (2004). Modelling sunlight disinfection in a high rate pond. *Ecological Engineering*, 22(2), 113-122.

- Curi, K. and Eckenfelder, Jr., W.W. (1980). *Theory and Practice of Biological Wastewater*. New York: Springer.
- Dampin, N., Tarnchalanukit, W., Chunkao, K., & Maleewong, M. (2012). Fish growth model for Nile tilapia (*Oreochromis niloticus*) in wastewater oxidation pond, Thailand. *Environmental Sciences*, 13, 513-524.
- Emerald, F. M. E., Prasad, D. S., Ravindra, M. R., & Pushpadass, H. A. (2012). Performance and biomass kinetics of activated sludge system treating dairy wastewater. *International journal of dairy technology*, 65(4), 609-615.
- Esa, S. K., Haque, A. A. M., & Murshed, M. (2013). Performance of sewage oxidation pond in USM Engineering Campus. *Caspian Journal of applied science research*, 2(12), 219-225.
- Fauzi, S. H. M., & Jamil, N. M. (2021). Wastewater Treatment Process: A Modified Model for Oxidation Pond. *Journal of Advanced Research in Fluid Mechanics and Thermal Sciences (in press)*.
- Friedman, A. A., Peaks, D. A., & Nichols, R. L. (1977). Algae separation from oxidation pond effluents. *Journal (Water Pollution Control Federation)*, 111-119.
- Gehring, T., Silva, J. D., Kehl, O., Castilhos, A. B., Costa, R. H. R., Uhlenhut, F., ... & Wichern, M. (2010). Modelling waste stabilisation ponds with an extended version of ASM3. *Water Science and Technology*, 61(3), 713-720.
- Gloyna, E. F., & World Health Organization. (1971). Waste stabilization ponds. *WHO, Geneva*, 175.
- Grady Jr, C. P. (1999). Biological wastewater treatment. *Revised an expanded*.
- Gray, N. F. (2004). *Biology of wastewater treatment (Vol. 4)*. World Scientific.
- Hamzah, A. A. S. S. S. (2017). Mathematical modelling of biological wastewater treatment of oxidation pond and constructed wetland systems. *PhD thesis, Universiti Teknologi Malaysia, Faculty of Science*.
- Hamzah, A. S. S. S., & Murid, A. H. M. (2018). Nonlinear Partial Differential Equations Model Related to Oxidation Pond Treatment System: A Case Study of mPHO at Taman Timor Oxidation Pond, Johor Bahru. *MATEMATIKA: Malaysian Journal of Industrial and Applied Mathematics*, 293-311.
- Hamzah, A. S., Murid, A. H., Aziz, Z. A., Banitalebi, A., Rahman, H., & Hamdon, N. (2016). Modeling of microbial approach in wastewater treatment process: A case

- study of mPHO in Taman Timor oxidation pond, Johor, Malaysia. *AIP Publishing LLC* (pp. Vol. 1750, No. 1, p. 030023). In AIP Conference Proceedings.
- He, S., & Li, P. (2020). A MATLAB based graphical user interface (GUI) for quickly producing widely used hydrogeochemical diagrams. *Geochemistry*, 80(4), 125550.
- Horan, N. J. (1989). *Biological wastewater treatment systems: theory and operation*. John Wiley & Sons Ltd.
- Howell, J. A., & Atkinson, B. (1976). Influence of oxygen and substrate concentrations on the ideal film thickness and the maximum overall substrate uptake rate in microbial film fermenters. *Biotechnology and Bioengineering*, 18(1), 15-35.
- Hugh, R. (2019). UNDERSTANDING OXIDATION PONDS. IS DISSOLVED OXYGEN PROFILING THE KEY? *DO in wastewater*.
- Hülsen, T., Batstone, D. J., & Keller, J. (2014). Phototrophic bacteria for nutrient recovery from domestic wastewater. *Water research*, 50, 18-26.
- Imhoff, K., Imhoff, K. R., Kempa, E., & Kowal, A. L. (1996). Sewage of cities and sewage treatment: Guidebook. *Projprzem-EKO Publishing House*.
- Itodo, A. (2018). Introduction To Treatment. *Journal of Water Technology and Treatment Methods*, 1 Issue: 1, 8.
- IVAMI. (2016). *Phototrophic bacteria in soils, waters, sludges, fertilizers (efficient microorganisms)*. Retrieved from Instituto Valenciano de Microbiología: <https://www.ivami.com/en/microbiology-fertilizers/5443-phototrophic-bacteria-in-soils-waters-sludges-fertilizers-efficient-microorganisms>
- IWK, K. I. (2018). *Sustainability Report 2017-2018*.
- Kayombo, S. T. S. A., Mbwette, T. S. A., Katima, J. H. Y., Ladegaard, N., & Jrgensen, S. E. (2004). Waste stabilization ponds and constructed wetlands: design manual.
- Kayombo, S., Mbwette, T. S. A., Katima, J. H., & Jorgensen, S. E. (2003). Effects of substrate concentrations on the growth of heterotrophic bacteria and algae in secondary facultative ponds. *Water Research*, 37(12), 2937-2943.
- Khan, M. S., Raza, W., Gul, H., Hussain, M., Malik, B., Azam, M., & Winter, F. (2021). A Study on the Reaction Kinetics of Anaerobic Microbes Using Batch Anaerobic Sludge Technique for Beverage Industrial Wastewater. *Separations*, 8(4), 43.

- Kiepper, B. H. (2013). Microalgae utilization in wastewater treatment. *UGA Cooperative Extension Bulletin*, 1419, 1-6.
- Kobayashi, M., & Tchan, Y. T. (1973). Treatment of industrial waste solutions and production of useful by-products using a photosynthetic bacterial method. *Water Research*, 7(8), 1219-1224.
- Kutty, S. R. M., Isa, M. H., Nasiru, A., Salihi, I. U., & Ezerie, H. (2014). Potential of the compact extended aeration reactor (CEAR) as an integrated system to biologically degrade municipal sewage according to Malaysian regulatory limits: design, process and performance. *WIT Transactions on Ecology and the Environment*, 186, 269-279.
- LeChevallier, M. W., Schulz, W., & Lee, R. G. (1991). Bacterial nutrients in drinking water. *Applied and environmental microbiology*, 57(3), 857-862.
- LeChevallier, M. W., Welch, N. J., & Smith, D. B. (1996). Full-scale studies of factors related to coliform regrowth in drinking water. *Applied and environmental microbiology*, 62(7), 2201-2211.
- Leclerc, H. D. A. A., Mossel, D. A. A., Edberg, S. C., & Struijk, C. B. (2001). Advances in the bacteriology of the coliform group: their suitability as markers of microbial water safety. *Annual Reviews in Microbiology*, 55(1), 201-234.
- Li, D., & Liu, S. (2019). Chapter 8-Water quality detection for Lakes. In *Water Quality Monitoring and Management* (pp. 221-231).
- Ling T., Liew C. F., Modingin A., & Samaranan, K. (2013). Effectiveness of Oxidation Ponds in Pig Farm Wastewater Treatment in Sarawak. *Universiti Malaysia Sarawak (UNIMAS)*.
- Ling, Y., & Mahadevan, S. (2013). Quantitative model validation techniques: New insights. *Reliability Engineering & System Safety*, 111, 217-231.
- Madukasi, E. I., & Zhang, G. (2010). Microaerobic biodegradation of high organic load wastewater by phototrophic bacteria. *African Journal of Biotechnology*, 9(25), 3852-3860.
- Majid, M. R., Johar, F., Mustafa, N. I., & Yusof, J. N. (2012). Tamans without Biodiversity: Good Old Oxidation Ponds to the Rescue.
- Manitcharoen, N., Pimpunchat, B., & Sattayatham, P. (2020). Water Quality Analysis for the Depletion of Dissolved Oxygen due to Exponentially Increasing Form of Pollution Sources. *Journal of Applied Mathematics*.

- Mara, D. (2009). Waste stabilization ponds: Past, present and future. *Desalination and Water Treatment*, 4(1-3), 85-88.
- Mara, D. (2013). *Domestic wastewater treatment in developing countries*. Routledge.
- McFeters, G. A., & Stuart, D. G. (1972). Survival of coliform bacteria in natural waters: field and laboratory studies with membrane-filter chambers. *Applied microbiology*, 24(5), 805-811.
- Mohammadi, M., Man, H. C., Hassan, M. A., & Yee, P. L. (2010). Treatment of wastewater from rubber industry in Malaysia. *African Journal of Biotechnology*, 9(38), 6233-6243.
- Monod, J. (1949). The growth of bacterial cultures. *Annual review of microbiology*. 3(1), 371-394.
- Myung, K. K., Kyung-Min, C., Cheng-Ri, Y., Ki-Young, L., Wan-Taek, I., Ju, H. L., & Sung-Taik, L. (2004). Odorous swine wastewater treatment by purple non-sulfur bacteria, *Rhodopseudomonas palustris*, isolated from eutrophicated ponds. *Biotechnology letters*, 26(10), 819-822.
- Nath, K., & Das, D. (2009). Effect of light intensity and initial pH during hydrogen production by an integrated dark and photofermentation process. *International Journal of Hydrogen Energy*, 34(17), 7497-7501.
- Oberkampf, W. L., & Trucano, T. G. (2002). Verification and validation in computational fluid dynamics. *Progress in aerospace sciences*, 38(3), 209-272.
- Ockendon, J. R., Wake, G., Teo, K. L., Loxtan, R., Araújo, A., Widodo, B., & Ramli, H. (2014). Mathematical Modeling and Optimization for Biological-based Treatment of Taman Timor Oxidation Pond, Johor. *Malaysian 2nd Mathematics in Industry Study Group (MISG 2014)*, 1-37.
- Okubo, Y., Futamata, H., & Hiraishi, A. (2006). Characterization of phototrophic purple nonsulfur bacteria forming colored microbial mats in a swine wastewater ditch. *Applied and environmental microbiology*, 72(9), 6225-6233.
- Olutiola, P. O., Awojobi, K. O., Oyedele, O., Ayansina, A. D. V., & Cole, O. O. (2010). Relationship between bacterial density and chemical composition of a tropical sewage oxidation pond. *African Journal of Environmental Science and Technology*, 4(9), 595-602.
- Płuciennik-Koropczuk, E., & Myszograj, S. (2019). New approach in COD fractionation methods. *Water*, 11(7), 1484.

- Radwan, M., Willems, P., El-Sadek, A., & Berlamont, J. (2003). Modelling of dissolved oxygen and biochemical oxygen demand in river water using a detailed and a simplified model. *International Journal of River Basin Management*, 1(2), 97-103.
- Sadeghi, G. H., Mohammadian, M., Nourani, M., Peyda, M., & Eslami, A. (2007). Microbiological quality assessment of rural drinking water supplies in Iran. *Journal of agriculture & social sciences*, 3(1), 31-33.
- Sah, L., Rousseau, D. P., & Hooijmans, C. M. (2012). Numerical modelling of waste stabilization ponds: where do we stand? *Water, Air, & Soil Pollution*, 223(6), 3155-3171.
- Samer, M. (2015). *Biological and chemical wastewater treatment processes*. Wastewater treatment engineering, 150.
- Shilton, A. N., & Mara, D. D. (2005). CFD (computational fluid dynamics) modelling of baffles for optimizing tropical waste stabilization pond systems. *Water Science and Technology*, 51(12), 103-106.
- Shilton, A. N., Mara, D. D., Craggs, R., & Powell, N. (2008). Solar-powered aeration and disinfection, anaerobic co-digestion, biological CO₂ scrubbing and biofuel production: the energy and carbon management opportunities of waste stabilisation ponds. *Water science and technology*, 58(1), 253-258.
- Singer, S., & Nelder, J. (2009). Nelder-mead algorithm. *Scholarpedia*, 4(7), 2928.
- Smith, D. B., Hess, A. F., & Opheim, D. (1989). Control of distribution system coliform regrowth. In Proceedings of the AWWA Water Quality Technology Conference. *American Water Works Association, Denver*, pp. 1009-1029.
- Sonune, A., & Ghate, R. (2004). Developments in wastewater treatment methods. *Desalination*, 167, 55-63.
- Spellman, F. R., & Drinan, J. (2014). *Wastewater stabilization ponds*. Boca Raton: CRC Press.
- Stukel, T., Greenberg, E., Dain, B., Reed, F., & Jacobs, N. . (1990). A longitudinal study of rainfall and coliform contamination in small community drinking water supplies. *Environmental science & technology*, 24(4), 571-575.
- Talaiekhozani, A., & Rezania, S. (2017). Application of photosynthetic bacteria for removal of heavy metals, macro-pollutants and dye from wastewater: A review. *Journal of Water Process Engineering*, 19, 312-321.

Tharavathy, N. C., Krishnamoorthy, M., & Hosetti, B. B. . (2014). Oxidation pond: A tool for wastewater treatment. *Journal of Ecology and Environmental*, 2, 1-4.

Wang, W., & Lu, Y. (2018). Analysis of the mean absolute error (MAE) and the root mean square error (RMSE) in assessing rounding model. In *IOP conference series: materials science and engineering*, Vol. 324, No. 1, p. 012049.

Wierenga, J. T. (1985). Recovery of coliforms in the presence of a free chlorine residual. *Journal-American Water Works Association*, 77(11), 83-88.

Williams, R. J., White, C., Harrow, M. L., & Neal, C. (2000). Temporal and small-scale spatial variations of dissolved oxygen in the Rivers Thames, Pang and Kennet, UK. *Science of the total environment*, 251, 497-510.